

Post Visit Report:
**DSEI (Defence and Security Equipment International), Royal United Services
Institute (RUSI), Royal Aeronautical Society (RAS) and International Institute for
Strategic Studies (IISS)**
London 9-15 September 2019

*By: Air Marshal (r) Javaid Ahmed
Omer Aamir*

1. A two member PAF team comprising Air Vice Mshl Amir Masood DCAS (Trg) AHQ and Air Mshl (r) Javaid Ahmed from CASS visited DSEI London from 9-15 Sept 2019. The team besides visiting DSEI was to deliver a talk on Pulwama and Kashmir to Royal United Services institute RUSI and interact with other UK based think tanks. A brief on the visit is presented in the following paragraphs.

2. **Visit DSEI Excel Centre London.** DSEI is a leading event that connects governments, national armed forces, and industry thought leaders and the global defence & security supply chain. With 1700-exhibitors and 36000 attendees the event presents core innovations of defense technologies. PAF delegation visited stalls of leading exhibitors and discussed ongoing PAF programs and future business opportunities. Opportunities to better the training modules of PAF were also discussed during the visit.

(a) **Comments.** The exhibition was very well attended. A core area of business in 2019 exhibition consisted of UAV's and their operational equipment, as well as anti UAV hardware. The exhibition also showcased new corporations emerging out of numerous mergers of UK based companies, due to serious competition at the international level. Most traditional hardware had being modified to incorporate artificial intelligence and new computer and LCD based applications. Instead of off the shelf military hardware, OEMs vendors were keen to introduce customised solutions for specific customers. The near absence of the Chinese and Russian defence industry in the exhibition pointed to emerging rivalries and trade wars between the Western and Eastern blocks. The Tempest program inauguration was another highlight of the exhibition. The BAE "Tempest" is a proposed 6th generation stealth fighter concept to be designed and manufactured in UK for the RAF and Italian Air force. The development consortium known as "Team Tempest", consists of the UK MoD, BAE, Rolls-Royce, Leonardo S.p.A. and MBDA. Tempest is intended to enter service by 2035 to replace the Eurofighter Typhoon aircraft in service with the RAF and AMI (Italian Air Force). Two billion pounds will be spent by the British government on the project by 2025. Team Tempest only displayed a mockup and did not take questions as most core development areas were still in the conceptual phase. Also on display were UK Navy's latest ships and helicopters such as the Phlynx

(which incorporated the EW suite). PAF team also met the RAF organizers who were keen to know of PAF impression of the show. Defense Export Promotion Organization (DEPO) from Pakistan and Hindustan Aeronautical Limited (HAL) from India also displayed a few products in the exhibition. Pakistan Air Force Team also visited the stalls of different other arms manufacturers including those for thermal imaging, and screw manufacturers.

3. **Talk at RUSI 10th Sept 2019.** The Royal United Services Institute (RUSI) is an independent think tank engaged in cutting edge defense and security research. Founded in 1831 by the Duke of Wellington, RUSI embodies nearly two centuries of forward thinking, free discussion and careful reflection on defense and security matters. The presentation on Pulwama air operations and Kashmir was delivered by Air Mshl (r) Javaid and Air Vice Mshl Aamir. The presentation was chaired by Professor Malcom Chalmers Deputy Director General RUSI and attended by members of academia, students, research think tanks, Defence Attache of United Kingdom to Pakistan and Army & Air Attache of Pakistan to United Kingdom. The salient features of the talk were as follows.

(a) **Points covered by Air Mshl Javaid**

- i. The title of the presentation was; Kashmir: a predictive analysis in light of Pulwama and Balakot.
- ii. Brief introduction to the region. One of the longest running rivalries. India not reconciled to partition. India in transition with serious identity issues.
- iii. History and Status of Kashmir. 40th day of curfew. Largest jail in the world. Kashmir and 565 other princely states at partition, thousands of Jagirs, colonial way of ruling.
- iv. Legal position, 11 UN Resolutions, self-determination vs internal matter, right to protest vs terrorism. Serious differences in interpretation by both sides.
- v. Outstanding issues: Kashmir, Siachin, Sir Creek etc, map interpretation issue, Kulbshan case. Hybrid warfare used against Pakistan. In Afghanistan, \$5 billion investment by India. Ajit Dovals' SASTRA university address on 21st Feb 2014 is on record of fomenting trouble in Pakistan. Indian involvement in terrorism Baluchistan, attacks on the Chinese consulate, Mehran base, Karachi Airport, twice on Kamra, on cadets in Sargodha, on Police facility in Mananwala, ISI office in Lahore, GHQ, APS, Wagah and Hazaras and on various other places in Pakistan. Attack on Sri Lankan cricket team in 2009
- vi. Resulting conflicts, 04 wars: 1948,1965,1971,1999 and 7 crises including Brass tacks 1986, 1990 IOK uprising, 2001, 2008, Uri 2016, Pulwama 2019.
- vii. Pakistan and Indian political situation. Radicalizing India, Hindutva, the end of secularism, plight of minorities, BJP: the next five years. Pellet gun usage, India trying to adopt Jared Kushner model in Kashmir.
- viii. Leadership of both sides (Personality analysis of Modi and Imran Khan)
- ix. Pakistan: the next five years
 - x. The media on both sides, Indian Think Tanks (509 think tanks in India spewing hatred against Pakistan) and the rise of fakes, Modi's troll army, Indian media fanning war hysteria. In Pakistan, only about 50 think tanks
 - xi. The current issue of abrogation of article 370 has been the most serious issue of recent times

- xii. Role of the UN and international players
- xiii. Detailed case study of escalation dynamics (Pulwama) and how a similar situation can spiral out of control. To limit escalation across contiguous borders is very difficult
- xiv. Center for Aerospace and Security Studies (CASS) predicted the Pulwama incident.
- xv. Indian Air Force was used because of influence of Indian movies on their national psyche
- xvi. Recommendations to resolve the situation
- xvii. What if Questions? 1- Another Pulwama when Curfew is lifted? 2- International Community should take note.

(b) Points covered by AVM Aamir

- i. A lesser known fact is that Pakistan Air Force shot down 8 Russian jets during Soviet-Afghan war
- ii. Pakistan has successfully undertaken anti-terrorist operations all across the duration of Pakistan's war on terror. 80% of the casualties inflicted on terrorists has been by Pakistan Air Force.
- iii. The success of the operations can be attributed to accurate human intelligence and legitimacy of the government and forces undertaking the operations
- iv. Government resolved to weed out terrorism from the country and the Pakistani Armed forces and law enforcement agencies had the support of the Public. The macabre like situation created by terrorists had galvanized public opinion in favor of destroying their infrastructure and hideouts.
- v. India's response to Pulwama lacked maturity.
- vi. Both Pakistan and India had BVR's, as such Pakistan had no technical advantage during the current air skirmish after Pulwama. It was the skill of PAF pilots and effective planning that won Pakistan the aerial conflict.
- vii. All Indian bombs missed the intended target
- viii. During the counter strike after Balakot air incursion, PAF deliberately took cursor off targets in the terminal stage to avoid casualties. The aim remained to send a clear message that PAF was capable of targeting Indian areas at a time and place of its choosing.
- ix. 8 targets were disengaged after being locked on to avoid further escalation because of the intent of the commander.
- x. The Indians shot down their own helicopter due to poor communication amongst IAF personnel and strategic paralysis created by PAF thus creating a fog of war situation through which Indians couldn't maneuver out of.
- xi. Indians may try to do another misadventure and are already pre-emptively trying to shift the blame to Pakistan.
- xii. The details of air operations from both sides were comprehensively covered by media and foreign journalists verified Pakistan's version regarding the events.
- xiii. Pakistan's geo-strategic and geo-economic importance is perpetual

(c) Question and Answer Session. The wide ranging session focused on soliciting details of air operations and on predictions for future course of action on the Kashmir issue. The Indian participants were also keen to know about Pakistan's financial constraints, impending

FATF sanctions and its effect on military development programs. Some questions also focused on the regional dynamics of Afghanistan and Iran. Questions also asked about Pakistan's JF-17 program and its development.

(d) **Remarks.** RUSI faculty generally works in the remote mode as most senior members were working out of station and abroad on assignments. However, it was felt that the think tank lacked the required support for ongoing R&D projects. This aspect was also affecting RUSI's standing in the UK think tank community. The interaction with RUSI experts was useful in highlighting Pakistan's perspective on the current situation in Kashmir and the dangers of the situation spiraling out of control due to any misadventure. Invitation to RUSI experts for participation in G-STAR were also handed over to faculty members.

4. **Chairman Joint Chiefs of Staff Committee talk at International Institute of Strategic Studies IISS.** CASS representatives were also invited to IISS and the talk by CJCS. The event was attended by around 20 people including IISS directors and numerous research fellows from other institutes. The CJCS spoke on the topic of Strategic stability in South Asia.

The speech started by highlighting the serious implications of the regional dimension for peace and stability in South Asia as well as its wider ramifications for peace and security in the larger Asian region and in the world. The chairman linked his talk on world instability to the hundred year's anniversary of the end of World War 1. He stated that a few core areas and lessons of World War 1 were relevant even today. The first being that even in those times International Institutions could not succeed in preventing war, secondly International treaties were not respected, third diplomacy was not successful and fourth that the policy of appeasement proved fatal and emboldened rising powers whose ideology was based on fascism and supra-nationalism. The same was now happening in South Asia. He further stated that in a region which constituted one fourth of the Global population and which had the potential to become an economic engine was caught in a web of strategic stability, which was fragile and caught up in issues between two Nuclear weapon States. He stated that the Indians had acted in an irresponsible manner in February, 2019. He opined that that peace and stability could only be guaranteed by a rule based global order rather than by those seeking a hegemony and dominance. He further stated that the past few decades had seen growing military imbalance and an unwillingness to peacefully resolve disputes which had further constrained strategic stability. He also elaborated Hindutva ideology and talked in detail about the Kashmir issue. He also stated that since Independence Pakistan had been striving to balance its foreign and security relations with India. However, despite Pakistan's efforts to promote peace and cooperation, Pakistan was being confronted with hybrid strategies through conventional, sub conventional and cyber domains. He further explained that Pakistan maintains a modest force posture and rationality in its nuclear Doctrine to counter an adversary that kept expanding the spectrum of threat for which Pakistan had to adjust continuously. Reflecting on the Kashmir issue in detail, he annotated several peace initiatives by Pakistan and international offers for mediation, stressing

on the fundamental right of self-determination of the Kashmiri people. Talking about the Pulwama incident and Indian irresponsible behaviour he cautioned about chances of a nuclear war. He further elaborated that in South Asia strategic stability was strained by irresponsible and provocative behaviour by India-including recent impetuous statements by the defence minister on the no first use policy. He ended the talk by stressing that the strategic stability in South Asia required moving out of the status quo by making concrete efforts towards a solution to all outstanding disputes.

(a) Question and Answer Session. The questions in the session pertained to regional security dynamics with emphasis on the Kashmir issue.

(b) Remarks. The session was well attended by experts in various domains. The CJCS put forward Pakistan's position emphatically. The arrangements for the talk were however, modest with the sound system being a source of problem.

5. Chairman Joint Chiefs of Staff Committee talk at RUSI. CJCS was invited to RUSI to talk about the security dynamics in South Asia. CASS representatives were invited to join the talk. The talk was attended by RUSI members, academicians, journalists, Air & Army Attaché of Pakistan and research fellows. Gen. Zubair Hayat talked about evolving trends in geo-economics, geo-strategy and emerging geo-political dynamics. He remarked that intolerance in the world was increasing and emerging security concerns have been reshaping relationships between and amongst states. He stated that we live in an era of disruption. He also talked about de-globalization and an increasing trend towards localization. He also stated that the global centre of gravity is gradually shifting towards the East & South and the global defence spending was at its highest with budgetary allocations amounting to \$ 1.8 trillion dollars. The current post truth age has led to the rise of fake news. He further stated that the monopoly on use of force was fast eroding. He stated that South Asia is the largest importer of Conventional Weapons and resource induced conflicts are exacerbating. Climate Change, food security affecting South Asia and water is a major issue of South Asia. He insinuated towards eroding monopoly of states on use of force and the privatization of warfare.

Gen. Zubair further stated that 500 years ago, South Asia was producing 25 % of World's GDP. However, when the British left, this figure had come down to only 3%. He then touched upon issues of rising Ultra-nationalism and pre-medieval ideologies such as Hindutva. He pointed towards India's destabilizing moves such as Anti-satellite tests and Cold Start doctrine. He stated that in Afghanistan, despite two decades of conflict, peace remained elusive. Uncertainty in Afghanistan has adversely affected Pakistan through refugees (3rd generation of Afghans living in Pakistan), economic burden, loss of life and instability in border areas. He stressed that non-contiguous powers have no role in Afghanistan. Gen. Zubair mentioned the amalgamation of FATA into Pakistan and first elections in human history having been conducted there. A final word on the Afghan conflict was that time will be needed to settle the issue. On the Afghan issue, there is a rare convergence of interest between the Great Powers and Pakistan, he said

He then elaborated on the Indo-Pak conflict. He emphasized that the Kashmir issue was at the heart of the conflict and a nuclear flashpoint. It was not a bilateral issue. UNSC resolutions had pledged to Kashmir the right of Self Determination. Indian atrocities in Kashmir had increased and the Indian forces had adopted a policy of keeping the LoC hot after illegal Annexation of Kashmir. Since Burhan Wani's death on 8th July 2016, mass all out operations have been launched by Indian forces to curb dissent. He highlighted the US religious freedom report on 'minorities living under fear' in India. He said saffronization of Indian society & politics had taken place. Gen. Zubair demanded the immediate lifting of complete curfew, ending of lockdown and banning use of pellet guns. He also called for implementation of the 2003 Ceasefire agreement and the UNSC resolutions on Kashmir. He said that there will be no perfect solution and we must cooperate on areas we can. He ended his talk by stating that Pakistan should be looked at a lens from what it is and not from the lens of New Delhi and Kabul.

(a) Question and Answer Session. In response to Mr Khalid Nadim (a correspondent) inquiry regarding challenges in Kashmir border region, he replied that Kashmir is the most militarized zone in the World. There has been a 1400% increase in Cease fire Violations in the last decade. The use of field artillery has been seen for the first time in 20 years and the use of cluster bombs for the first time ever. The casualties have also increased from zero to more than 400. The hotline between DGMO's of both countries served no useful purpose. He further stated that Pakistan would not take dictation from any regional hegemon and dialogues should be based on sovereign equality. International intervention was required and any dialogue should not be restricted to bilateral only. Responding to another question regarding Pakistan-China relationship from a RUSI Senior Researcher Gen. Zubair stated that the relationship was time tested. He said that great power competition and shifting geo-politics should not be the prism to look at Pakistan-China relationship. Dr. Sarah Ashraf of London School of Economics posed a question about the Afghan Peace process and inquired about the fairly absent Afghan government voice in the current talks. She further questioned that some Afghans had suspicions regarding Pakistan. Gen. Zubair replied that after the current cycle of violence, the region must move towards stability and there was likely to be protracted conflict if the peace process failed. Ms. Victoria Schofield posed a question on whether Pakistan would want a moral high ground in UNGA when India fires across or will it respond to provocation. Gen. Zubair replied that the Army would not sit back when civilian casualties were happening in IHK. He further said that UNMOGIP has full freedom to operate in Pakistan whereas in India, they were kept in a concentration camp. With regards to Kashmir, Post-Pulwama, 672 terrorist incidents have taken inside Pakistan alongside 130 IED attacks in which 386 Pakistanis had been killed. This fact was not highlighted at any forum as a hybrid war had been imposed on Pakistan. Unilateral annexation of territory was fundamentally wrong such as the Russian annexation of Crimea. Gen. Zubair also advised researchers to reword questions to distinguish between a legitimate freedom struggle and terrorism in response to a question by Ms. Victoria Schofield.

6. **Visit to Royal Aeronautical Society.** The PAF team also visited Royal Aeronautical Society and called on Sir Brian Burrige Chief Executive and Prof Jonathan Cooper President.

Issues of mutual interest were discussed in detail. These included enhancing cooperation between RAS and PAF as well as CASS. Invitation to attend G-STAR conference in February, 2020 were also forwarded to the RAS. The RAS was also conducting internship courses for fresh aeronautical engineering students. RAS was keen on enhancing its membership for paid members and pointed towards the requirement for funds generation.

Conclusion.

The visit was the first foreign visit undertaken by a Centre for Aerospace and Security Studies (CASS) delegation. The purpose of the visit was to enhance bilateral collaboration between CASS and foreign think tanks & societies. Exchange of ideas and perspectives took place that are foundational to the intellectual development and stimulation. CASS is in its incipient stages and therefore such exchange visits will be useful for not only enhancing collaborations but also increasing the visibility of CASS in the international arena. Useful ideas that are formulated through such interactions can achieve fruition through being incorporated into the research projects. In the conclusion, it can be said that CASS delegation gained and delivered at the same time through this visit and in the future more such visits should be undertaken involving the directors and researchers to build further relationships and increase the outreach of CASS in the international think tank community. CASS built bilateral linkages through this visit and in the future, these linkages will be strengthened through exchange of ideas and researchers.